



TECHNIUM
SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL



Vol. 54/2024
A New Decade for Social Changes

PLUS
COMMUNICATION



International
Communication & PR

Appointment of Village Apparatus From A Good Governance Perspective in Wori District, North Minahasa Regency

Oktavianus Jus Mayuntu¹, Marthinus Mandagi², Goinpeace H. Tumbel³

Public Administration Magister Program, Faculty of Social Sciences and Law,
Universitas Negeri Manado

Email: mayuntuoktavianus24@gmail.com¹, marthinusmandagi@unima.ac.id²,
goinpeacetumbel@unima.ac.id³

Abstract. This research aims to 1) To see the process of appointing village officials in accordance with the principles of good governance; 2) To find out and analyze what are the inhibiting and supporting factors for Village Heads in Wori District in Recruiting Village Officials in Wori District, North Minahasa Regency; 3) To find out and analyze how the Village Head in Wori District considers improving the professionalism of village officials from a good governance perspective. This research uses qualitative research methods with the focus of the research being the process of appointing village officials in Darunu Village, Wori District, North Minahasa Regency, taking into account the principles of good governance. The results of the research show that both the selection and appointment processes have met the requirements for good governance, seen in a transparent and accountable manner, where information on selection and recommendations up to appointment follows the principles of transparency. Then, in terms of accountability, all village officials must have accountability requirements in terms of completeness of documents, education level, then they must go through the stages of screening and recommendation from the Head of the District, then the Village Head is appointed. The results of the screening, recommendations from the Head of the District and the appointment of Village Apparatus are carried out openly and then obey the law, where the consideration of the Head of Darunu Village can still be said to be sufficient because there are authorities that must be taken into account, such as the authority of the Head of the District and must be based on a clear legal umbrella and its application in the community still receives many complaints.

Keywords. Appointment, Village Officials, Good Governance, Professionalism, North Minahasa

A. Introduction

A village is a legal community unit that has territorial boundaries and is authorized to regulate and manage government affairs, the interests of local communities based on community initiatives, original rights and the system of government of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia [1]. Villages are the smallest part of a Regency/City which is the right target in implementing government development activities, considering that the Village Government is the lowest base of government in the organizational structure of the Indonesian

Government which makes it very decisive for the success of universal National Development (Mandagi, 2015)[2].

According to Willem Konijnenbelt (1997) in Kairupan et al. (2023), the position of principles/principles of good governance in the legal system is as unwritten law [3]. Kasman Abdullah in Mandagi et al. (2020) stated that good governance as a term that has been popular since the early nineties is as if a newly discovered formula for therapy for a country's government mechanism to run democratically [4]. Good governance has simply been interpreted and has displaced the old terminology, namely good government, which is no longer seen as effective. In the administration of government, good governance is actually not a new formula, but rather a principle or principle that is hundreds of years old and which should be the cornerstones of government in a modern democratic country, namely how the administration of government prioritizes the principles of participation, transparency and accountability, as well as opening up space for community involvement (Mandagi, 2023) [5]. According to the United Nation Development Program (UNDP), good governance, which was later quoted by the State Administration Institute (LAN), has nine main principles of participation, rule of law, transparency, responsiveness, consensus oriented, equity, effectiveness and efficiency, accountability and strategic vision [6].

With the existence of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, the administration of government in regions, especially districts/cities, is carried out on the principle of autonomy and assistance duties with the principle of autonomy as wide as possible in the system as well as the principle of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia [7]. The implementation of regional government is then called Regional Autonomy. The main spirit of the birth of the Village Law is actually a way to strengthen the foundation itself, both institutionally and the government system in order to improve the welfare of the community (Lumingkewas, 2006) [8]. Because the village with all its administrative equipment is an area that faces directly the people. Village Government is a local political center which is personified through the Village Head and Village Apparatus themselves (Kalesaran et al., 2023) [9]. In order to regulate and manage community interests, the government has issued Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages. In this law, the government has regulated the structure and procedures for administering government at the village level. Law number 6 of 2014 is a strong foundation for implementing governance and development in villages. One of the structures in village government is the Village Head. The Village Head is the spearhead of a village's success because he is the highest leader in village government [10].

Village government has a very important role in regional development and community welfare. One aspect that is very vital in carrying out village government tasks is the village apparatus. Village officials are elements of village government administrators who are tasked with providing services to the community, managing village finances, and building village infrastructure. Therefore, the appointment of village officials must be carried out appropriately and in accordance with applicable regulations (Indrianasari, 2017) [11].

However, in practice, problems often occur regarding the appointment of village officials. Some of these problems include the lack of transparency in the appointment process, the practice of nepotism or politicization in the appointment process, and the absence of adequate monitoring mechanisms for the performance of village officials. In village government, the village head plays an authoritative role and bears responsibility for overseeing the running of village government. Therefore, village officials were appointed as auxiliary bodies to support the village head in carrying out his responsibilities and authority. This apparatus functions as staff who assists the village head in formulating policies and

implementing village government. To become a village official, it cannot be done just like that, of course there are requirements that must be met by prospective village officials. Village officials are appointed by the village head from village residents who have fulfilled the general and specific requirements in accordance with Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2017 concerning the Appointment and Dismissal of Village Apparatus. Talking about the authority of the village head, one of his authorities can be to dismiss Village Officials, the implementation of which must be in accordance with the applicable laws and regulations. Based on Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2017 concerning Amendments to Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 83 of 2015 concerning Appointment and Dismissal of Village Officials (Rohman, 2020) [12].

It is explicitly explained that Village Officials are dismissed if they do not meet the criteria necessary to be considered as such and violate the prohibitions against being a village official. The rules governing management are contained in Law number 67 of 2017 concerning amendments to the Minister of Home Affairs Number 83 of 2015 concerning the appointment and dismissal of village officials. dismiss village officials.

Government Regulation no. 11 of 2019 is a Government Regulation concerning Personnel Management. This regulation regulates personnel management in government agencies, including personnel in villages. Government Regulation no. 11 of 2019 has a close relationship with village officials because this regulation regulates staffing in government agencies, including village officials. This regulation provides direction and guidelines for the government in managing personnel in villages, including in terms of appointment, training, promotion and dismissal of village officials. Therefore, it is important for the government and society to understand the provisions in Government Regulation no. 11 of 2019 in order to ensure that personnel management in the village is carried out well and in accordance with applicable regulations (Anggraeni, 2022)[13].

The Village Head as the leader of the Village Government who is assisted by other Village Apparatus; The Village Secretary, Regional Implementation and Technical Implementation, in his election has also fulfilled the requirements specified in Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages. The Village Head in article 26 of Village Law Number 06 of 2014 himself is tasked with organizing Village Government, implementing Village Development, and empowering Village Communities (Sumeru, 2016) [14].

Government Regulation no. 11 of 2019 is a government regulation which contains personnel management in government agencies, including staffing in villages. This regulation has a close relationship with the analysis of the problem of appointing village officials in the villages of Wori District. In carrying out this analysis, several aspects related to the provisions in Government Regulation no. 11 of 2019, such as the process of accepting village officials which is carried out through open and non-discriminatory selection, training and competency development for village officials, promotion of village officials based on a transparent and objective system, and the dismissal of village officials which is carried out in accordance with applicable regulations.

For example, in analyzing the issue of dismissal of village officials in the Village, it can be seen whether the dismissal process was carried out in accordance with the provisions of the applicable laws and regulations, as regulated in Article 116 paragraph (1) of Government Regulation no. 11 of 2019. Apart from that, it can also be analyzed whether there are underlying causes for the dismissal of village officials, such as violations of the code of ethics or poor performance, so that appropriate action can be taken and in accordance with applicable regulations.

On the other hand, in analyzing the problem of appointing village officials in Wori District Village, it can be seen whether the selection process was carried out openly and non-discriminatorily, and whether there were clear and objective criteria in determining the selected village officials. Apart from that, it can also be analyzed whether there are efforts made by the village government to provide training and competency development to village officials, in accordance with the provisions regulated in Article Law number 67 of 2017.

Thus, Law number 67 of 2017 is an important reference source in analyzing the problem of appointing village officials in Wori District Village. In carrying out this analysis, this regulation can be a guide and reference in ensuring that personnel management in the village is carried out well and in accordance with applicable regulations.

Based on the North Minahasa Regent's Regulation number 17 of 2019, it is regulated that the appointment and dismissal of Village Officials is carried out based on the recommendation of the Head of the District based on Chapter VI Article 8 paragraph 7 which explains the recommendation for written approval from the Head of the Subdistrict, which is the basis for the Old Law/Village Head in appointing Candidates for Village Officials with an Old Law Decree. . From here, polemics began to emerge based on which of these regulations should take priority. The results of initial observations with one of the Darunu Villages in Wori District show that there is a Village Head who has taken his rights in structuring the organization in the Village, but then the administrative services in this village are very slow, one resident admitted that it took more than a week to process the certificate can't afford it, the Village Officials themselves are rarely seen at the village office to serve the community, data on poor people receiving aid sometimes results in duplicate data, this is very contrary to the principles of good governance.

There was an interesting conversation in the village community about which assistants (Perangkat) would be selected and appointed by the Village Head. Opinions, predictions and expectations about what kind of people will complete the village government structure. Which of the old village officials will the elected village head still retain, or will there be major changes and reshuffles? It even goes so far as to come up with alternative possibilities that are preferred by the community regarding the people who will be chosen as village heads. An exchange of shadows and possible compositions emerged among the community.

Of course, the most important thing for village communities is that the welfare and progress of the village is the most desired hope. These conditions often give rise to excessive desires, especially that the elected village head is asked to choose people who are proposed based on the suggestions and wishes of the community. The Village Head then tries to accommodate this, which often gives rise to problems that follow, because in general the community does not understand that there is a mechanism that must be followed in the appointment of village officials.

Empirical facts seen and felt directly by the author are the basis for researching them directly. Complaints from various groups regarding the appointment of village officials are often received, especially from village officials. Every time the Village Head Election (Pilkades) is held, there is concern and anxiety, whether if the Village Head changes, the village officials will also be massively replaced according to the Head's wishes. Village? The reality that happened was true, there was a major overhaul and change, the old Village apparatus was significantly dismantled, dismissed and replaced by a new Village Apparatus. There is no guarantee that the Regulations on the Implementation of Appointments of Village Officials can protect and provide certainty that their service as village officials will remain in accordance with applicable regulations. The aim of the research is the implementation of village

appointments and apparatus in Wori District, North Minahasa Regency. However, with the existence of Law number 67 of 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants, the process of appointing village officials in Wori District Village must refer to this regulation. In Law number 67 of 2017, the requirements, procedures and mechanisms for appointing civil servants, including village officials, are explained.

The things mentioned above will then have an impact on the implementation of good governance. As we know, the word governance is not the same as using government. Ganie Rochman stated that the concept of "government" refers to a management organization based on the highest authority (state and government). The concept of "governance" involves not only the government and state, but also the role of various actors outside the government and state, so that the parties involved are also very broad (Joko Widodo, 2001).

This research is about the analysis of the appointment of village officials according to the principles of good governance in Wori District, North Minahasa Regency. Complaints from various groups regarding the appointment of village officials are often received, especially from village officials. Every time there is a Village Head Election there is concern, whether if the Village Head changes, the Village officials will also be massively replaced according to the wishes of the Village Head and previous management which was considered good will change.

B. Method

This research is a naturalistic descriptive research with a qualitative approach which aims to systematically describe certain facts or characteristics factually and carefully. Researchers act as observers who observe symptoms and observe behavior that occurs. In this case, researchers observe symptoms and phenomena that arise in the field and then process them into data. Bogdan in Lexy J. Moleong (2013) said that qualitative research is a research procedure that produces descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from people and observable behavior. This approach is directed at settings and individuals holistically (whole)[15].

The focus of this research is the process of appointing village officials in Darunu Village, Wori District, North Minahasa Regency, taking into account the principles of good governance. This research will involve a case study in Darunu Village, Wori District, North Minahasa Regency. This village was chosen because it is a government unit that represents the village level and can provide relevant insights in the context of appointing village officials. The data analysis technique used is the Miles & Huberman approach model in Dilapanga et al. (2023), namely data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions [16]. Then, to ensure the validity of the data, researchers used the 4 main criteria presented by Lincoln and Guba in Sendouw et al. (2023), namely credibility, dependability, transferability, and confirmability [17].

C. Result and discussion

Which Rules are More Appropriate, Observation Requirements at the Time of Networking, and Appointment of Village Officials

In the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 67 of 2017 concerning Amendments to the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 83 of 2015 concerning the Appointment and Dismissal of Village Officials, signed by the Minister of Home Affairs Tjahjo Kumolo on August 2 2017 and promulgated in Jakarta by the Director General of Legislation of the Ministry Law and Human Rights on September 5 2017 in State Gazette Number 1223 of 2017 concerning Appointment and Dismissal of Village Officials.

Permendagri Number 67 of 2017, in essence to strengthen the appointment and dismissal of village officials, in principle this Permendagri is the operational function of the Village Head in implementing a decision. This cannot be separated from the requirements of law number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages with the existence of this Village Law which is not very strong in dealing with Village empowerment. Coupled with the village provisions carried out by the Village Head, the emphasis of the Village is quite high in developing the Village, along with This was the birth of various policies, namely Permendagri Number 83 of 2015 concerning the appointment and dismissal of Village officials, that the provisions in Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 83 of 2015 were still lacking and could not accommodate the needs that occurred in the appointment and dismissal of Village officials, the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation was born. Number 67 of 2017 concerning the appointment and dismissal of Village officials.

Several provisions in Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 85 of 2015 concerning the appointment and dismissal of village officials (State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia of 2016 Number 5) were amended in Minister of Home Affairs Number 67 of 2017 due to: 1) Decision of the Constitutional Court in case Number 128/XIII/2015, the provisions of article 50 letter c of Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Villages are declared contrary to the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia and do not have binding legal force so that they have legal implications in the appointment and dismissal of Village officials; 2) There are deficiencies and cannot accommodate the needs that occur in the appointment and dismissal of village officials in the provisions of Minister of Home Affairs Regulation Number 85 of 2015 concerning the appointment and dismissal of village officials.

Village officials can indeed be dismissed from their positions but this dismissal must refer to the rules regarding the mechanism for dismissing Village officials. Village officials cannot be dismissed unilaterally and without good reasons as stated in Minister of Home Affairs number 67 of 2017 concerning the appointment and dismissal of Village officials. in article 5. The requirements for Village officials as referred to in article 5 Paragraph (3) letter d are contained in Permendagri number 67 of 2017 Article 2 paragraph (2).

If you have become a village official, it is certain that village officials have certain prohibitions so that there is no deviation from their position as a village official. The prohibitions on village officials as referred to in article 5 paragraph (3) letter e are contained in "article 51 of Village Law Number 6 of 2014 concerning Village" that village officials must not act arbitrarily on their own. There are also rules for temporary dismissal of village officials regulated in Permendagri Number 67 of 2017 article 6.

As stated in the law or articles, village, regional and city governments are protected by law, therefore the village head cannot immediately fire his village officials unilaterally without implementing the applicable rules because it can be said to be legally flawed..

Policies Used from a Good Governance Perspective in Appointing Village Officials

It can be concluded from the results of the selection data up to the appointment of village officials following a good governance perspective where registration for selection for the selection team for village officials is carried out transparently because it is announced through the village office and then in the selection process the principle of accountability is used which is based on the conditions set out in the Minahasa Regent's regulations. North No. 17 of 2019. The indicators above are that the consideration of the head of Darunu Village in the requirements to become a village official for the head of Darunu Village is sufficient to take into account the absence of Darunu Village officials who have less than a high school education,

in terms of age even though there are no Darunu Village officials who are 20 years old. years to early 30 years but there are no Darunu Village officials under the age of 20 and the regional regulations of North Minahasa Regency cannot be taken into consideration anymore because they are no longer relevant to Law No. 6 of 2014 concerning Villages.

However, in terms of policy, it can be concluded that the considerations of the Darunu Village head are in the form of 1) Education; 2) Age; 3) Social culture. There are no points that contradict the terms and conditions for village officials in Law No. 6 of 2014 concerning Villages and also Minahasa Regent Regulation No. 17 of 2019, even adding considerations regarding social culture will really help the implementation of village government.

The lack of skills of the people of Darunu Village in becoming village officials can be seen from the greater number of people in Darunu Village who prefer to be farmers rather than office workers. From the author's observations and interviews with two representatives of farmers in Darunu Village, they do not have time to take care of other work apart from the garden. Apart from this, people of productive age and high school graduates mostly choose to continue or help the businesses that their parents already own rather than trying something new. This is also usually called ignorance of the legal vacuum that exists in the North Minahasa Regency, North Sulawesi.

It can be concluded from all the descriptions above that the inhibiting factors include 1) Lack of community skills with high school graduates as village officials; 2) Lack of willingness of people aged 20 years to early 30 years to become Village officials.

Darunu Village Head's Considerations in Increasing the Professionalism of Village Officials from a Good Governance Perspective

Considerations made to increase the capacity of Village Officials who have been appointed based on supporting factors are 1) The large number of people with various graduates, so that the Darunu Village head has a variety of choices; 2) The abundance of productive age resources from both women and men.

From the data above, it is known that there are still many complaints from the people of Darunu Village, which can be put into three points, namely: 1) Village officials are difficult to find. Village officials are difficult to find. This is a problem that according to the author's observations when conducting research, Darunu Village officials are rarely available at the Darunu Village office, even on active working days; 2) Slow in responding to problems. The problem of being slow to respond to problems, this could be due to side jobs for Village officials, and limited facilities at the Darunu Village office; 3) Not open about Village Funds.

The conclusion from the good governance indicators is the principle of obeying the law. The consideration of the Darunu Village Head can still be said to be sufficient, however, it is a bit ignoring the dual positions that occur. The indicators are explained as bellow:

1) The principle of obeying the law: The consideration of the Darunu Village Head can still be said to be sufficient, however, it slightly ignores the dual positions that occur.

2) Principles of Orderly Administration: There are still many Darunu Village officials who do not carry out government in an orderly manner, as evidenced by the fact that there are still Darunu Village officials who delegate their duties to other officials, carry out tasks that are not in accordance with their responsibilities, and do not know about their duties..

3) The principle of public interest regarding community aspirations in the appointment and dismissal of village officials has been implemented, however in other government issues such as the allocation of Village funds it is not very open. regarding community aspirations in the appointment and dismissal of village officials has been

implemented, however other government issues such as the allocation of village funds are not very open.

4) The principle of openness of the Darunu Village government is quite fulfilled, because it is only open to village apparatus issues but is open to the Village community, especially regarding Village Fund issues.

5) The principle of proportionality in terms of proportionality is still not fulfilled due to delays in legal products from the regions. In terms of proportionality, it is still lacking due to delays in legal products from the regions.

6) The principle of professionalism is fulfilled because Darunu Village officials are determined at the beginning of the appointment of Darunu Village officials. The expertise here is also supported by the education of Darunu Village officials.

7) The principle of accountability is still lacking because village officials are not open, services are slow and village officials are difficult to find at the Village Office. Considerations by the Head of Darunu Village can still be said to be sufficient, however, there is a slight neglect regarding the dual positions that occur.

D. Conclusion

Based on the research results and discussion above, the following conclusions can be made:

1) In the judicial review, the village head in dismissing village officials must refer to the Minister of Home Affairs regulation number 67 of 2017 concerning the Appointment and Dismissal of Village Officials, so that there are no cases of dismissal of village officials without referring to the Minister of Home Affairs Regulation or the applicable laws and regulations which contain the Minahasa Regent's Regulations. Utara no. 17 of 2019, Law no. 6 of 2014. Both the selection and appointment processes have fulfilled the requirements in terms of good governance, seen in a transparent and accountable manner where the selection information and recommendations up to appointment follow the principles of transparency. Then, in terms of accountability, all village officials must have accountability requirements in terms of completeness of documents, level of education, then they must go through the stages of screening and recommendation from the Head of the District, then they are appointed by the Head of the Village.

2) The efforts of the Darunu Village head to increase the professionalism of village officials, namely:

a. Taking education, age and social culture into consideration when selecting village officials, which has an impact on the realization of the principle of professionalism, however, the absence of further review of the capabilities of village officials and also disproportionality because there are multiple positions in the government structure, makes these considerations inefficient.

b. Dismissing officials who do not carry out their duties, this can support the realization of efficiency, so that it can minimize complaints from the community and can also help the implementation of village government so that it is not hampered by the presence of an apparatus who does not carry out his obligations.

3) The conclusion from the good governance indicators is the principle of transparency where the results of the screening, recommendations from the Head of the District and the appointment of Village Officials are carried out openly and then obey the law, where the consideration of the Head of Darunu Village can still be said to be sufficient because there is authority that must be taken into account, such as the authority of the Head of the District and

must be based on a legal umbrella. What is clear is that its application in society still gets a lot of complaints.

References

- [1] I. Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal & Transmigrasi, “Peraturan Menteri Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi Nomor 4 Tahun 2015 tentang Pendirian, Pengurusan dan Pengelolaan, dan Pembubaran Badan Usaha Milik Desa.” Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi, Jakarta, 2015.
- [2] M. Mandagi, *Perencanaan Pembangunan*. Malang: Wineka Media, 2015.
- [3] S. B. Kairupan, M. Mandagi, J. Mantiri, and M. Rantung, “Performance of Village Government Apparatus in Public Service in Administration (Case Study in Taas Village, Tikala Subdistrict, Manado City),” in *Unima International Conference on Social Sciences and Humanities (UNICSSH 2022)*, 2023, pp. 1808–1816.
- [4] M. M. Mandagi, J. Mantiri, and S. B. Kairupan, “Implementation of Smart Governance in Realizing Tomohon Smart City,” in *Iapa Proceedings Conference*, 2020, pp. 437–448. doi: <https://doi.org/10.30589/proceedings.2020.420>.
- [5] M. Mandagi, “Tata Kelola Administrasi Pemerintahan Desa Di Desa Suluan Kecamatan Tombulu Kabupaten Minahasa,” *J. Adm. J. Kaji. Kebijak. dan ilmu Adm. Negara*, vol. 5, no. 1, pp. 28–36, 2023.
- [6] & L. A. N. Badan Pengawasan Keuangan dan Pembangunan, “Akuntabilitas Dan Good Governance (Modul 1 Dan 5) Modul Sosialisasi Sistem Akuntabilitas Kinerja Instansi Pemerintah (AKIP).” Badan Pengawasan Keuangan Dan Pembangunan, Jakarta, 2000.
- [7] R. Indonesia, “Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 23 tahun 2014 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah.” Sekretariat Negara RI, Jakarta, 2010.
- [8] L. A. Lumingkewas, *Reformasi Birokrasi Dalam Perspektif Otonomi Daerah*. Manado: Universitas Negeri Manado, 2006.
- [9] R. J. Kalesaran, M. Mandagi, and G. Tumbel, “Implementasi Administrasi Pemerintahan Desa Di Desa Pineleng Satu Timur Kecamatan Pineleng Kabupaten Minahasa,” *JISIP (Jurnal Ilmu Sos. dan Pendidikan)*, vol. 7, no. 1, 2023.
- [10] P. N. R. Indonesia, “Undang-undang (UU) Nomor 6 Tahun 2014 tentang Desa.” Pemerintah Pusat, Jakarta, 2014.
- [11] N. T. Indrianasari, “Peran perangkat desa dalam akuntabilitas pengelolaan keuangan desa: Studi pada desa Karang Sari Kecamatan Sukodono,” *ASSETS J. Ilm. Ilmu Akuntansi, Keuang. dan Pajak*, vol. 1, no. 2, pp. 29–46, 2017.
- [12] A. Rohman, “Kewenangan Penjabat Kepala Desa Dalam Mengangkat Perangkat Desa,” *Syiar Huk. J. Ilmu Huk.*, vol. 18, no. 1, pp. 62–82, 2020.
- [13] S. Anggraeni, “Analisis Yuridis Sinkronisasi Peraturan Menteri Dalam Negeri Nomor 11 Tahun 2019 Tentang Perangkat Daerah Yang Melaksanakan Urusan Pemerintahan Dibidang Kesatuan Bangsa Dan Politik Terhadap Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 18 Tahun 2016 Tentang Perangkat Daerah.” Universitas Islam Malang, 2022.
- [14] A. Sumeru, “Kedudukan pejabat kepala desa dalam penyelenggaraan pemerintahan desa,” *JKMP (Jurnal Kebijak. dan Manaj. Publik)*, vol. 4, no. 1, pp. 47–56, 2016.
- [15] L. J. Moleong, *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*, Revisi. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2013.
- [16] A. R. Dilapanga, T. Pangalila, and B. F. Supit, “Analysis Of Village Direct Cash Assistance Policy Implementation In East Bolaang District Bolaang Mongondow

- Regency,” *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 39, pp. 89–97, 2023, doi:
<https://doi.org/10.47577/tssj.v39i1.8260>.
- [17] R. H. E. Sendouw, E. M. C. Lumingkewas, B. F. Supit, and P. M. M. Kapojos, “Analysis of Performance Appraisal of State Civil Apparatus in the Regional Office of Education of North Sulawesi Province,” *Tech. Soc. Sci. J.*, vol. 49, pp. 90–96, 2023.