



**TECHNIUM**

SOCIAL SCIENCES JOURNAL

9 R 08

1

\$ Q H Z G H F D  
I R U V R F L D O

, 6 6 1



Z Z Z W H F K Q L X P V F L H Q F H F R E

## **R and L in the warsh transmission (compared to the hafs transmission)**

**Vugar A. Garadaghly**

Associate Professor of the Department of Arabic Philology, Doctor of Philosophy in Philology, Baku State University, Baku, Azerbaijan

[garadaghly@gmail.com](mailto:garadaghly@gmail.com)

**Abstract.** In the research, pronunciation features of r and l consonants were studied on the basis of Hafs and Warsh transmission systems narrated from Asim and Nafe, respectively, where different characteristics of the mentioned consonants were investigated both within the two transmission systems and in comparison to each other, by means of an applied comparative method. Additionally, it was noted that conclusions derived from studied Hafs transmission system narrated from Asim were topical also for the modern Arabic language. Conducted statistical analysis and a comparative study of the two transmission systems enable us to define the linguistics norms of r and l consonants for both transmission systems. It is noted that in the transmission system narrated from Asim there is no norm for r consonant, that is to say, there is no stable norm for r sound in the accommodation system, as it is characterized as two different sounds, being pronounced both as a hard sound and as a soft sound in definite situations, which is related to the influence of sounds around it, making the two cases as two different norms. Differently from the Hafs transmission system, in the Warsh transmission system, in case of an adjoining or short [a] sound with interval emphatic [s], [t] or [z] sound, an open and short or a long vowel before l or double l sound with a following non-labialized, open and short or long sound, it is pronounced, within the emphatic feature, as a hard sound with incomplete onward adjoining or interval adaptation.

**Keywords.** accomodation, vocalic inflection, imālah, taqlīl, Warsh, Hafs

**Specific transcription (Unicode compatible) symbols necessary for our study were added:**

â – *fathah* in the position after *ṣād, dād, ṭā', zā', khā', ghayn* or *qāf*

a – *fathah* in the position after hard (medium) *rā' (r)*, 'ayn, hard (medium) *lām (l)*, *wāw* or double nasal *wāw (w̃-w̃)*

ä – *fathah* in the position after *hamzah, bā', tā', thā', jīm, dāl, dhāl, rā' (r)*, *zāy, sīn, shīn, fā', kāf, lām (l), mīm, nūn, hā', yā'* and before *ṣād, dād, ṭā', zā', khā', ghayn, qāf, ḥā', rā' (r)*, 'ayn, *lām (l)*, *wāw* and double nasal *wāw*

ə – *fathah* in the position after *hamzah, bā', tā', thā', jīm, dāl, dhāl, rā' (r)*, *zāy, sīn, shīn, fā', kāf, lām (l), mīm, nūn, hā', yā'* and before *hamzah, bā', tā', thā', jīm, dāl, dhāl, rā' (r)*, *zāy, sīn, shīn, fā', kāf, lām (l), mīm, nūn, hā', yā'*

e – *fathah* in the position before or after *hamzah, bā', tā', thā', jīm, dāl, dhāl, rā' (r)*, *zāy, sīn, shīn, fā', kāf, lām (l), mīm, nūn, hā', yā'*

- ā, ā, ā, ā; ī; ū – long vowel in the size of two short vowels  
 ââ, ââ, ââ, ââ; īī; ūū – long vowel in the size of four short vowels  
 âââ, âââ, âââ, âââ; īīī; ūūū – long vowel in the size of six short vowels  
 âu, au, âu; ây, ay, ây, ey – diphthongs in two short vowel sizes  
 âuū, auū, âuū; âyū, ayū, âyū, eyū – diphthongs in four short vowel sizes  
 âuūū, auūū, âuūū; âyūū, ayūū, âyūū, eyūū – diphthongs in six short vowel sizes  
 ˘ – stress mark (á, á, â, á, é, í, ú, â, â, â, â, é)  
 ĵ – ĵīm in the position before any consonant, except ĵīm  
 ḏ – ḏāl in the position before any consonant, except ḏāl or tā'  
 ṛ – hard (medium) rā'  
 q̣ – qaf in the position before any consonant, except qāf or kāf  
 ḷ – hard (medium) lām  
 m – mīm in the position before a vowel  
 m̃ – mīm in the position before any consonant, except mīm or bā'; mim if a pause is performed  
 m̃̃ – mīm in the position before bā'; nasal nūn or tanwīn transformed into nasal mīm in the position before bā'  
 m̃m̃ – double nasal mīm  
 m̃-m̃ – double nasal mīm in the position after mīm at the intersection of words; double nasal mīm in the position after nūn or tanwīn at the intersection of words  
 n – nūn or tanwīn in the position before a vowel  
 ñ – nūn or tanwīn in the position before hamzah, ḥā', khā', 'ayn, ghayn or hā'; nūn in case if a pause is performed; nūn in the position before wāw or yā' in qīñwānuñ, ṣīñwānuñ, yā sūñ wal-qur'ānīl-ḥakīm ||, nūūñ wal-qālami, duñyā, buñyānuñ; nūn if a pause is performed  
 ñ̃ – nūn or tanwīn in the position before tā', thā', ĵīm, ḏāl, dhāl, zāy, sīn, shīn, fā' or kāf  
 ñ̃̃ – nūn or tanwīn in the position before ṣād, ḏād, ṭā', zā' or qāf  
 ññ – double nasal nūn  
 ñ-ñ – double nasal nūn  
 w̃-w̃ – double nasal wāw in the position after nūn or tanwīn  
 ỹ-ỹ – double nasal yā' in the position after nūn or tanwīn  
 || – pause (waqf)

## 1. Literature Review

As it is known, in modern Arabic, including the Hafṣ transmission system narrated from Asim, which is considered as the basis for it, there is no unanimity among scholars of both middle ages and modern times on *r* sound in regard whether it is a hard or a soft sound. Taking into consideration that pronunciation of *r* consonant requires rise of posterior region of the tongue towards the hard palate, characteristic for the *isti'la* feature [8, 88-90], most of scholars in the middle ages considered it as a hard sound, while its soft pronunciation in definite cases was accepted as a derivation from general rule or as a secondary case [18, 407]. However, several others were convinced that *r* sound should not be considered as a hard or soft sound, as hardening and softening occur because of different reasons. [13, 2, 90]. Another group of scholars tended to stand closer to the second opinion: *r* sound hardens when it gains features of the *isti'la* phenomenon [3, 68], while one of the main features is *istifal* [20, 106].

Let us remember that *isti'la* and *istifal* that are features that contradict each other and are contrary one to another. The first one refers to sound hardening as a result of upstream air inclination during pronunciation, while the latter referring to downstream air inclination, which, on the contrary, softens the sound [8, 84]. In literature, the dictionary term for *r* sound hardening

is (التفخيم) *tafkhim*, which means “enlargement”, “veneration”, “magnification”, “exaltation”, “thickening” and in linguistic regard “hard pronunciation”, while the dictionary term for softening is (الترقيق) *targig*, referring to “thinning”, “softening” or “soft pronunciation” in linguistics. The *hardening-softening* principle implemented by medieval scholars enables “visual” vitalization of the case, helping, at the same time, to present its essence as succulently as possible. Furthermore, the principle shows that this case occurs under the influence of adjoining sounds. Interestingly, modern Arab linguists also perceive it from this point of view. Ibrahim Anis, one of the founders of modern Arabic linguistics, conducted an analysis by use of 1000 words, where he concluded that *r* sound in Arabic bears 46% *fathah* and 14,6% *dammah*, which indicates its *tafkhim* character. Also, it bears 14,6% *kasrah*, showing its *targig* feature due to soft pronunciation of مرقة. Additionally, he noted that Arab scholars use *r* sound mostly as *tafkhim* [2, 66].

In Arabic studies in Azerbaijan, the only article on the mentioned consonant bears a general informative character [7].

## 2. Research Method

Our analysis was conducted on the basis of a comparative and statistical methods applied to the pronunciation features of the Hafs and Warsh transmission systems narrated from Asim and Nafe, respectively. The purpose was to define linguistic norms for each of them.

## 3. Results

### *R* in the Hafs and Warsh Transmissions

Those who consider *r* sound mainly as a hard sound reach this conclusion after learning phonetics of Arabic, which in turn, was formed, as stated above, on the basis of the Hafs transmission system of the Koran narrated from Asim. Modern phoneticists do not pay attention whether *r* sound in the Warsh transmission system narrated from Nafe is hard or soft, as the object of their studies is phonetics of modern Arabic, which is not based on the mentioned transmission system. Therefore, pronunciation of *r* sound in the Hafs and Warsh transmission systems should be studied separately, after which a conclusion could be made on the basis of studied factual materials existing in the transmission systems. Our analysis shows that there is a significant difference between the Hafs and Warsh transmission systems in regard to pronunciation of *r* consonant.

Opinions on pronunciation of *r* sound in the Hafs transmission system were shortly but successfully expressed by medieval and modern Arab scholars, who basically repeated the former: *ra* with *dammah* or *fathah*, including *ra* before *dammah* or *fathah* and without vowel is pronounced with *takhfim*, while *ra* with *kasrah*, including *ra* before *kasrah* and without vowel is pronounced with *targig* [1, 97-99; 6, 26; 9, 46-49; 12, 155; 16, 97; 19, 27; 22, 70]. For example, رُكْبَانًا فَإِدَا [rukbanā-fa'idhā], هُمُ الْخَسِرُونَ [hūmul-khāsirūn], أَلْهَكُمُ التَّكَاثُرُ [’alhakumut-takāthuru], بَكَرٌ [bīkrūn], رَبُّكَ [rābbukā], أَغْرَقْنَا [’aghrāqna], وَيُولُونَ الدُّبُرَ [wayuwallūnād-dūburā], كَفَّارًا [kuffārañ], رَزَقًا [rīzqāñ], نُخْرِجُونَ [tukhrijūnā], وَالزُّبُرِ [waz-zūburi], بِقَادِرِينَ [biqādirīñ].

However, notwithstanding the quite effective expression of the definition, it doesn't explain the reason of the case, but only presents the fact, ignoring any explanation relating to the subject.

A statistical analysis conducted on the Hafs transmission system shows that in 12668 cases *r* sound was used in 76,65% as a hard sound and only in 23,35% as a soft sound. Apparently, soft pronunciation of *r* sound amounts only a quarter of its hard pronunciation. Therefore, hard pronunciation of *r* sound in the Hafs transmission system is accepted by us as normal. As to soft pronunciation of *r* sound in this system, it can be considered as its adaptation.

In the Hafs transmission system, including literary Arabic, soft pronunciation of *r* sound is stipulated by the following conditions:

In case of non-labialized, closed and short or long vowel [i]/[ī] after *r* or *rr* sound, it is pronounced with partial (incomplete) regressive (backward) contact adaptation in accordance with articulation. Here, the non-labialized closed soft vowel [i] (kasrah) partially adapts *r* sound to backward contact, conditioning by this way its soft pronunciation. For example: رَزَقًا [rízqāñ], قَرِيبٌ [qārībuñ], نُصِرَفُ [nušárrifu], بِضَارَيْنَ [bidāāārrīnə];

In case of non-labialized, closed and short or long vowel [i]/[ī] before *r* sound in a closed syllable, it is pronounced with partial (incomplete) progressive (forward) contact adaptation in accordance with articulation. Here, the non-labialized closed soft vowel partially adapts *r* sound to forward contact, conditioning by this way its soft pronunciation. For example: وَأَصْبِرَ [wá-šbir], قَدِيرٌ [qádīr ||].

In the Hafs transmission system and in Arabic, *r* sound can be mainly considered as a hard vowel, while in the Warsh transmission system such an opinion cannot be supported certainly.

A statistical analysis conducted on the Warsh transmission system shows that *r* sound was used in 57% as a hard sound and in 43% as a soft sound (Here, softening of *r* sound as a result of the influence of change in its position is taken into consideration, when the stylistic characteristics of the Warsh transmission system as inflection (*taglil*), ['] sound drop and *wagf* is not implemented). Apparently, soft and hard pronunciations of *r* sound are not equal to each other, but they are very close. Therefore, we accept that in the Warsh transmission system *r* sound is both hard and soft and we consider it as hard and soft adaptation in both cases.

In the Warsh transmission system, soft pronunciation of *r* sound is stipulated by the following conditions:

In case of non-labialized, closed and short or long vowel [i]/[ī] after *r* or *rr* sound, it is pronounced with incomplete progressive contact adaptation. Here, the non-labialized closed soft vowel partially adapts *r* sound to forward contact, conditioning by this way its soft pronunciation. For example: وَأَصْبِرَ [wá-šbir], قَدِيرٌ [qádīr ||].

In case of non-labialized, open and short or long vowel [a]/[ā]; labialized, closed and short or long vowel [u]/[ū]; adjoining or interval non-labialized closed short or long vowel [i]/[ī] or adjoining half-vowel [y] before *r* sound, it is pronounced with incomplete progressive contact adaptation or interval adaptation in accordance with articulation. Here, the non-labialized closed soft vowel partially adapts *r* sound to forward contact, conditioning by this way its soft pronunciation. For example: يَغْفِرُ [yāghfiru], تُثِيرُ [tuthīru], بَشِيرُوهُنَّ [bāshirūhuññə], فَسِيرُوا [fāsīrū], نُقِرُ [nuqírru], يَخْرُوا [yākhírrū], أَلْخَيْرُ [ʿəl-khāyru]; حَصِرَتْ [hāširət], مَصِيرَكُمْ [māšīrəkuñ], الذِّكْرَاتِ [ʿədh-dhəkirəti], مِيرْتٌ [mīrəthu], سِرِّكُمْ [sīrrəkuñ], غَيْرَهَا [ghāyrəhə], خَيْرْتٌ [khāyrətuñ]; السِّحْرَ [ʿəs-síhrə], إِخْرَاجُهُمْ [ʿikhrəjūhuñ], بَكْرٌ [bíkrūñ].

In the Warsh transmission system, hard pronunciation of *r* sound is stipulated by the following conditions:

In case of non-labialized, open and short or long vowel [a]/[ā] or labialized, closed and short or long vowel [u]/[ū] before *r* sound or double *rr* sounds; any other sound but non-labialized closed short or long vowel [i]/[ī] or adjoining half-vowel [y] before it, it is pronounced with incomplete regressive contact adaptation or interval adaptation in accordance with articulation. For example: حَدَرَ [hādhāra], بَارَكْنَا [bāráknə], أَرَادَ [ʿārādə], خَسَارًا [khāšārañ], مُحَرَّرًا [muḥārrārañ], حَارَبَ [hārabə], يَتَذَكَّرُ [yətədhəkkāru], نَارٌ [nāru], كَفَرُوا [kəfārū], وَمَارُوتَ [wamārūtə], سَحَرُوا [sāḥarū], فَتَرَةَ [fətrətīn], فَأَخْرَجَ [fəʾəkhrajə], أَجْرُهُمْ [ʿəjruhuñ];

In case of non-labialized, open and short or long vowel [ä]/[a]/[â]/[ā]/[ā̄] or labialized, closed and short or long vowel [u]/[ū] before *r* sound and in a closed syllable, it is pronounced as a hard sound with incomplete progressive contact adaptation. For example: بَشْرَتُمُونِي [bəshshärtumūnī], الْعَرْشِ [ʿəl-ʿarshi], بُرْهَانِكُمْ [buḥhānəkum], يَكْفُرُ [yákfur].

It can be concluded that in the Hafs transmission system, *r* in [ir̄u], [īru], [ir̄ū], [īrū], [ir̄ru], [īr̄rū], [yr̄u], [i#ru] sound combinations pronounced as a hard sound because of [u] after it and in ; [ira], [īra], [ir̄ā], [īrā], [ir̄ra], [yra], [yr̄ā], [i#ra], [i#rā] sound combinations pronounced also as a hard sound because of [a] after it is pronounced as a soft sound in the Warsh transmission system: [iru], [īru], [ir̄ū], [īrū], [irru], [ir̄rū], [yru], [i#ru]; [irə], [īrə], [ir̄ē], [īrē], [irrə], [yrə], [yr̄ē], [i#rə], [i#rē].

Additionally, in the Warsh transmission system, *r* in 17 words are exceptionally pronounced as a hard sound: الْأَصْرَاطُ [ʿāṣ-ṣirāṭā], فِرَارًا [firārañ], فِرَاقُ [firāqu], ضِرَارًا [dirārañ], إِرَمَ [ʿiramə], إِبْرَاهِيمَ [ʿibrāhīmə], إِسْرَائِيلَ [ʿisrāāʾīlə], إِعْرَاضًا [ʿiʿrādāñ], عِمْرَانَ [ʿimrānə], مِدْرَارًا [midrārañ], الْأَشْرَاقِ [ʿāli-shrāqi], أَقْرَأَ [ʿiqraʿ], مِصْرًا [mīṣrañ], إِصْرًا [ʿiṣrañ], أَطْرَحُوهُ [ʿiṭraḥūhu], قِطْرًا [qīṭrañ], فَطَرَتَ [ffṭratə], وَقَرَأَ [wiḳrañ].

In the Warsh transmission system, in regard to hard or soft pronunciation of *r* sound, a special case can be observed in seven words used in the Koran 18 times.

Inasmuch as in the Hafs transmission system, *r* pronounced as a hard sound in ذِكْرًا [dhīkrañ] (2:200; 18:70, 83; 20:99, 113; 21:48; 33:41; 37:3, 168; 65:10; 77:5), حَجْرًا [hījrañ] (25:22, 53), إِمْرًا [ʿimrañ] (18:71), سِتْرًا [sītrañ] (18:90), وَزْرًا [wīzrañ] (20:100), صِهْرًا [ṣīhrañ] (25:54), حَيْرَانَ [ḥayrānə] (6:71) words, can be pronounced as a hard or soft sound in the Warsh transmission system. An additional interesting case comes forth here: Hard or soft pronunciation of *r* sound in all the words excluding the last word has a correlation with *maddi-badal* amounts extended during transmission. As it is known, in the Warsh transmission system, *maddi-badal* can be extended in 3 different amounts - 2, 4 and 6 short vowels. If *maddi-badal* in transmission has been defined as 4 short vowels, *r* in the mentioned words should be pronounced as a hard sound, while in case of the other amounts, it can be pronounced as a hard or soft sound. In other words, in the Warsh transmission system, *r* cannot be pronounced as a soft sound, if the amount of *maddi-badal* is 4 short vowels.

Another specific case is the pronunciation of *r* consonants in بَشْرَبَ [bishārariñ] in 77:32, as the first *r* consonant comes forth as a hard sound and the second one is pronounced as a soft sound in the Hafs transmission system (in case of *wagf*, both are pronounced as hard sounds): [bishārar̄ ||]), whereas in the Warsh transmission system, both are pronounced as soft sounds: [bishārariñ] (in case of *wagf*: [bishārər̄ ||]).

In case of inflection (*taglil*), widely used within the Warsh system, the drop of [ʿ] sound, which causes a change in the position of *r* sound, brings to its softening, if *wagf* is not implemented or type difference of the verb softens it. For example: أَخْرَى [ʿúkhṛā] → أَخْرَى [ʿúkhṛā]; أَنْظَرَ إِلَيْكَ [ʿāñzuri ʿiléykə] → [ʿāñzuri-léykə]; In 108:2, in case of *wagf* on the last word, *r* is pronounced as a hard sound: وَأَنْحَرَ [wá-nḥar̄ ||], while in case of no *wagf* and continuation with the third verse, *r* sound changes its position because of the dropped [ʿ]. As a result, it is pronounced with softening: وَأَنْحَرَ ۚ إِنَّ [wá-nḥarī-nḥə], نَعَفَرَ [nāghfir] (2:58; 7:161) → يُعَفِّرُ [yúghfār] (2:57), تُعَفِّرُ [túghfār] (7:161). Correlation between *r* sound and imalah/taglil was paid attention to as early as by Sibawayh, who explained it in details [19, 156-168].

#### 4. *L* in the Hafs and Warsh transmissions

*l* consonant is characterized in modern Arabic mainly as a soft sound, which is generally true also for the Hafs transmission system. Its hard pronunciation in modern Arabic and in the Hafs transmission system can be observed only in the word *Allah*. This occurs when [u] or [a]







57:15), where *l* sound bears adaption, or as [fiṣāʕlān], [tālā], [fātālā], i.e. softly, without any adaptation and full realization. It can be explained in such a way, probably, that one of the conditions bearing mutual interrelation of the adaptation (short [â] vowel with interval emphatic [ṣ], [t] or [z] sound before *l* consonant) disappears. Because, there is not a short, but a long vowel between *l* sound and [ṣ], [t] or [z] consonants, where long vowel [â] between *l* and [ṣ] or [t] certainly extends the interval. Pronunciation of *l* sound with adaptation is considered better than the contrary variant. It also includes the case when *wagf* is used: [tāā! || /tāā! ||], [fātāā! ||] → [fātāā! || /fātāā! ||]. In the Hafs transmission system, the verb يُصَلِّحَا [yūsliḥā] used in the 4<sup>th</sup> bab (4:128) is used in the Warsh system in the VI bab as يَصْلَحَا. Here too, two transmission variants are possible depending on adaptation of *l* sound in [ṣālā] sound combination, i.e. it is pronounced as a hard or soft sound: [yāṣṣālāḥā/yāṣṣālāḥā] (4:127).

## 5. Conclusion

1. In the Hafs transmission system, *r* consonant is accepted as a hard sound, while in the Warsh transmission system it can be either hard or soft.
2. In the Hafs transmission system, in case of non-labialized, closed and short or long ([i]/[ī]) vowel after *r* or double *rr*, it softens with partial progressive contact adaption in accordance with articulation. The same is true when non-labialized, closed and short or long ([i]/[ī]) vowel comes before *r* sound in a closed syllable.
3. In the Warsh transmission system, in case of non-labialized, closed and short or long ([i]/[ī]) vowel after *r* or double *rr*, it softens with partial progressive contact adaption in accordance with articulation. Furthermore, in case of non-labialized, open and short or long ([a]/[ā]) vowel after it, it softens with partial progressive contact or interval adaption in accordance with articulation. The same happens, when labialized, closed and short or long ([u]/[ū]) vowel comes after it or adjoining/interval non-labialized closed short/long adjoining ([i]/[ī]) vowel is pronounced after it. Besides, it softens in the same way in case of [y] half-vowel before it.
4. In the Warsh transmission system, in the following cases *r* or *rr* are pronounced as a hard sound with partial progressive contact adaption in accordance with articulation:
  - a) Non-labialized, open short or long ([a]/[ā]) vowel after *r* or *rr*;
  - b) Labialized, closed short or long ([u]/[ū]);
  - c) Any sound before it, except non-labialized, closed short or long ([i]/[ī]) vowel or [y] half-vowel;
  - d) In case of non-labialized, open short or long ([ä]/[a]/[â]/[ã]/[ā]/[ã]) vowel/labialized, short or long ([u]/[ū]) vowel before *r* consonant in a closed syllable.
5. In the Warsh transmission system, in case of emphatic [ṣ], [t] or [z] sounds with adjoining or short [â] vowel before *l* or *ll* sounds, after which come non-labialized, open short or long vowel, hardening is observed with partial progressive contact or interval adaptation in accordance with the emphatic feature.

## References

- [1] ‘Abd al-Samī‘, Aḥmad Maḥmūd al-Shāfi‘ī, *al-Wāfi Fī Keyfiyyah Tartīl al-Qur’ān al-Karīm*, (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-‘Ilmiyyah, 2000).
- [2] Anīs, Ibrāhīm, *al-’Aṣwāt al-Lughawiyyah*, (Cairo: Maktabah Nahḍah Miṣr, 1975).
- [3] al-Bahinsāwī, Ḥisām, *al-Dirāsāt al-Ṣawtiyyah ‘Inda ‘Ulamā’ al-‘Arab Wa al-Dars al-Ṣawtī al-Ḥadīth*, (Cairo: Zahrā’ al-Sharq, 2005).
- [4] al-Biqā‘ī, Burhān al-Dīn, *al-Qawl al-Mufīd Fī ‘Uṣūl al-Tajwīd*, (Beirut: Dār al-Bashā’ir al-’Islāmiyyah, 1995).

- [5] Bishr, Kamal, 'Ilm al-Aşwāt, (Cairo: Dār Gharīb, 2000).
- [6] al-Fawzān, 'Abd al-Raḥmān, *Durūs Fī Niẓām al-Şawtī Li al-Lughah al-'Arabiyyah*, (n.p.: n.p.p., 2007).
- [7] Garadaghli, Vugar, *Arab dilinde alveolyar [r] (ra) samit sesi //* Baku: Bakı Dövlət Universitetinin İlahiyyat fakultesinin Elmi mejmuesi, 22 (2014), pp. 99-106.
- [8] Garadaghli, Vugar, *Tajweed: Qurani-Kerimin tilaveti qaydalari: Asim qiraetinin Hefs revayeti esasında*, (Baku: Elm, 2011).
- [9] Garadaghli, Vugar, *Hafs ile Versh revayetlerindeki ferqlerde /r/, /l/ və /s/ fonemlerinin modifikasiyasının muqayiseli tehlili //* Baku: Bakı Slavyan Universitetinin Humanitar elmlerin oyrənilmesinin aktual problemleri Ali mekteblərarası elmi meqalelər mejmuesi, 1 (2020). pp. 43-55.
- [10] al-Ḥaddād, Muḥammad ibn 'Alī, *al-A'māl al-Kāmilah*, eds. Aḥmad al-Mi'şarāwī, Yaḥyā al-Ghūthānī, (Damascus: Dār al-Ghūthānī, 2010).
- [11] Hilāl, 'Abd al-Ghaffār Ḥāmid, *Aşwāt al-Lughah al-'Arabiyyah*, (Cairo: al-Jabalāwī, 1988).
- [12] al-Ḥuşarī, Maḥmūd Khalīl, *Aḥkām Qirā'ah al-Qur'ān al-Karīm*, ed. Muḥammad Taḥḥah Bilāl Minyār, (Beirut: Dār al-Başā'ir al-İslāmiyyah, 1997).
- [13] Ibn al-Jazarī, Shams al-Dīn Abū al-Kheyr, *al-Naşr Fī al-Qirā'āt al-'Ashr*, (Cairo: Dār al-Kutub al-'İlmiyyah, n.d.).
- [14] 'İṭiyyah, Qābil Naşr, *Ghāyah al-Murīd Fī 'Ilm al-Tajwīd*, (Jeddah: Maktabah Kunūz al-Ma'rifah, 2002).
- [15] Kopczynski, A. *The Consonants of Arabic and English*, // Poznan: Papers and Studies in Contrastive Linguistics of Adam Mickiewicz University, XXVII (1993), pp. 194-203.
- [16] Ma'bad, Muḥammad Aḥmad, *al-Mulakhkhaş al-Mufīd Fī 'Ilm al-Tajwīd*, (Cairo: al-Maktabah, 2002).
- [17] Maḥmūd, Muḥammad Aḥmad, *'Ilm al-Aşwāt*, (Riyad: Dār Kunūz Ishbīliyā, 2003).
- [18] Makkī ibn Abū Ṭālib, *Kitāb al-Tabşirah*, ed. Muḥammad al-Ghauth al-Nadwī, (Bombai: Dār al-Salafiyyah, 1982).
- [19] Mansour, Fouzan, "Konseptsiya fonetiki arabskogo yazika v knige Sibaveykhi "Al-Kitab""", Ph.D., (St Petersburg University, 2004).
- [20] al-Mārghinī, İbrāhīm, *al-Nujūm al-Ṭawāli 'Alā Durar al-Lawāmi' Fī Aşl Maqra' al-Imām Nāfi'*, (Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1995).
- [21] al-Mi'şarāwī, Aḥmad 'İsā, *al-Kāmil al-Mufaşşal Fī al-Qirā'āt al-Arba'ata 'Ashar*, (Cairo: Dār al-Imām al-Shāṭibī, 2009).
- [22] Mūsawī, Baldah Sayyid Muḥsin, *Hilyah al-Qur'ān*, (Tehran: Sāzmān Tablīghat al-İslāmī, 1999).
- [23] al-Ṭawīl, Rizq, *Fī 'Ulūm al-Qirā'āt*, (Mecca: al-Fayşaliyyah, 1985).