The 7th International Conference on Social Sciences
Organized by Faculty of Social Science and Law Manado State University

The Innovation Breakthrough in Digital and Disruptive Era
Implementation of Zoning System Policy in New Student Admission as an Effort to Equalize Education in Indonesia

Meirinawati¹,*, Indah Prabawati², Eva Fanida³, Galih Pradana⁴, Revienda Fitrie⁵

¹,²,³,⁴,⁵ Public Administration Study Program, Faculty of Social Science and Law, Universitas Negeri Surabaya
*Corresponding author. Email: meirinawati@unesa.ac.id

ABSTRACT

Education is a right for everyone. The problem that still occurs is the lack of equitable facilities and infrastructure to support education. One of the government's efforts to accelerate education equality is the establishment of a zoning policy through Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 14/2018 on New Student Admission. To measure the success of a policy implementation, this phenomenon will be analyzed using Edward III's policy implementation model. Edward III's theory is considered relevant to the analysis process for research with a qualitative approach. The purpose of this research is to see and describe the phenomena that occur in the implementation of the zoning system policy in the admission of new students as an effort to equalize Indonesian education. By using indicators of communication, resources, organizational structure, and attitudes or dispositions. This research shows the results of the implementation of the zoning system policy in PPDB which is quite good as an effort to equalize education in Indonesia.

Keywords: Education Policy, Equalize, Implementation, Zoning System Policy

1. PENDAHULUAN

Education is a very important component in supporting the development of a nation. The survival and progress of the nation, especially for developing countries, is determined by the progress or failure of education. This makes the role of education very important for every nation. As an Indonesian citizen, education is a right for everyone. This has been clearly regulated in the Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System which states that every citizen has the same right to obtain quality education. Although it has been regulated in such a way in various regulations, access and quality of education are still uneven [12]. According to Effendy in Saharuddin & Khakim (2020), access to education in various regions of Indonesia has been maximized, but the quality of each school is still very minimal and uneven [7].

Regarding access to education equality, there are 2 aspects that need to be considered, namely equal opportunities to obtain education, namely access to education that can be enjoyed by all school-age residents, and secondly, justice in obtaining the same education in society in the form of education that can be accessed by ethnic groups, religions and groups equally (Risna et al., 2020) [6]. One of the problems that still often occurs is the lack of equitable facilities and infrastructure to support education. It can be seen that schools in big cities have very advanced educational facilities and infrastructure, while those in villages or remote places only have makeshift facilities and infrastructure, even lacking teaching staff (Risna et al., 2020) [6]. In addition to problems with facilities and infrastructure, the quality of the teaching and education workforce is also still a problem in several
regions. This has also created a large gap between schools.

This background has encouraged many students who feel they have the potential to prefer to be able to attend favorite schools that have far more adequate facilities even though the distance of the school is far from their domicile. People will compete to enter favorite schools that are known for the fulfillment of complete facilities and infrastructure to support the learning process, competent and professional teaching staff, and top priority in providing access to participate in various competitions at regional, national and international levels (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7]. This will also have an unfavorable impact on the world of national education.

Seeing this problem, it is necessary to increase education equity, especially those targeted at underprivileged and remote communities. One of the government's efforts to accelerate education equity is the establishment of a zoning policy through the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation No. 14/2018 on Admission of New Learners for Kindergartens (TK), Elementary Schools (SD), Junior High Schools (SMP), Senior High Schools (SMA), Vocational High Schools (SMK), or other equivalent forms. In this regulation, the Admission of New Learners (PPDB) emphasizes the distance or radius between the student's home and the school, so that whoever is closer to the school is more entitled to get educational services from the school [5].

The zoning system was first implemented in 2017 and refined in 2018 through Permendikbud Number 14/2018. The latest regulation, Permendikbud Number 01 of 2021, states that new student admissions in the zoning system policy are divided into three pathways, namely the zoning pathway (distance from home to school) with a minimum quota of 50%, the affirmation pathway with a maximum quota of 15%, and the parental transfer pathway with a maximum quota of 5%. The purpose of implementing the zoning system policy according to Permendikbud Number 14/2018 states that the zoning system policy is to eliminate the label of favorite schools and realize equal access to education, justice and accelerate the quality of students, teaching staff and facilities and infrastructure. In addition, this policy aims to accelerate equitable distribution of quality education and is expected to synergize the three centers of education, namely schools, communities and families to provide awareness to the general public that the responsibility for education is not only in one party, but a shared responsibility (Risna et al., 2020) [6].

Through the implementation of this policy, it is hoped that public opinion regarding casteism and favoritism in the education system can be eliminated (Mai & Rahayu, 2021) [3]. Based on the results of research by Abidin and Ansori in Setiawati & Rahaju (2022), it is stated that the zoning system has created equity where outstanding students are not only in one favorite school, but are spread across various nearby or distant schools [9]. Based on research conducted by Ariani in Setiawati & Rahaju (2022), it shows that the implementation of the zoning system in the suburbs of Tulungagung Regency has a concrete impact, namely the discovery of many schools in rural areas that get the input of outstanding students [9]. In addition, research conducted by Wijaya in Setiawati & Rahaju (2022), also states that the zoning policy has shown the potential of students who are starting to be evenly distributed in various regions in Langkat Regency [9].

Launching the official website of the Ministry of Education and Culture, it is explained that the zoning system is an effort to prevent the accumulation of quality human resources and encourage local governments and communities to play a role in equalizing the quality of education. However, the implementation of this zoning system policy still finds various pros and cons. The zoning system has resulted in equal distribution of education only seeing from one point of view, namely making it easier to guide and teach students but racing in the field of diversity is very minimal, where only the neighborhood around the school has the opportunity to graduate at the intended school (Risna et al., 2020) [6]. Based on Purwanti's research in Setiawati & Rahaju (2022), it states that the zoning system policy for new student admissions in Bandung City as a whole does not consider regional mapping which results in school standardization and unclear intervention targets, resulting in a mismatch between regulations and implementation in the field [9]. In addition, based on research conducted by Saharuddin & Khakim (2020), it is stated that in Yogyakarta a number of student guardian representatives from SMP 5 and SMP 8 visited the DIY DPRD office to complain.
about PPDB with zoning channels, according to parents this system has an unfavorable impact on children, where high school choices are currently narrow and limited [7]. Another problem is that, due to the zoning system policy, many schools are reluctant to innovate to compete with other schools, because schools already feel easy to get students without having to do marketing or innovation (Saviti & Rahaju, 2016) [8]. The zoning system has also led to many cases where students do not want to receive education in the closest school to their domicile and choose to go to private schools that have more adequate facilities and quality.

In the policy implementation process itself, it is influenced by several factors. According to George Edward III's policy implementation model, which identifies 4 main determinant factors that influence policy implementation, namely:

1. Communication, this variable determines the effectiveness of policy implementation which is highly dependent on the understanding of decision makers regarding the division of roles and what must be done.

2. Resources include several elements, namely: 1) sufficient and competent members, 2) information on how to implement compliance data, 3) formal authority, and 4) facilities.

3. Attitude or disposition, relating to the compliance of implementers to be able to implement public policies.

4. Bureaucratic/organizational structure, related to cooperation, coordination, and procedures or bureaucratic work procedures involved in policy implementation. (Suparno, 2017) [10].

Picture. 1 Policy Implementation According to Edward III

Departing from the problems described above, the author is also interested in studying more deeply the implementation of the zoning system policy in the admission of new students as an effort to equalize Indonesian education. In order to measure the success of a policy implementation, this phenomenon will be analyzed using Edward III's policy implementation model. Edward III's theory is considered relevant to the analysis process for research with a qualitative approach. Based on the background of the problem that has been described, the problem formulation in this paper is how the implementation of the zoning system policy in the admission of new students as an effort to equalize Indonesian education. The purpose of this research is to see and describe the phenomena that occur in the implementation of the zoning system policy in the admission of new students as an effort to equalize Indonesian education.

2. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

2.1 Overview of the Zoning System

The zoning system policy in PPDB is a reform step in the education system in Indonesia with the aim of equalizing services and improving the quality of education in Indonesia (Setiawati & Rahaju, 2022) [9]. This policy is motivated by the title of superior schools or favorite schools owned by several schools, so that many students are competing to enter these schools even though they are far from their domicile, even outside their area. The school is considered to be able to provide the best service that guarantees the future of its students to choose and continue to the next best level of education, and can even determine the future of their life career. As a result, many certain learners cannot get quality education services due to geographical factors, transportation constraints, accommodation, and others due to the existence of superior schools which are generally located in big cities (Risna et al., 2020) [6]. The existence of a superior or favorite school label has also led to a coaching orientation and special treatment that results in the provision of facility resources only focused on these schools. This has also caused many regular schools to become less noticed and resulted in schools not developing.

Seeing these problems, the implementation of education policy through the zoning system is very important to realize education equity. The main priority of the education zoning system is the admission of new students based on the distance from the student's residence to the school. The technical regulation for implementing the zoning system policy is Permendikbud Number 01 of 2021, which clearly explains how zoning is implemented in PPDB from kindergarten to high school. As an illustration of the implementation of this zoning system policy, based on
research from Setiawati & Rahaju (2022) conducted at SMPN 3 Krian, the channels provided in the PPDB zoning system policy are the 50% zoning channel, 30% achievement channel, 15% affirmation channel, and 5% parental transfer channel. A total of 352 students have been admitted to the PPDB at SMP Negeri 3 Krian in 2021, consisting of:

Table 1. Student Data for PPDB SMPN 3 Krian in 2021

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pathway</th>
<th>Number of Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zoning Pathway</td>
<td>60 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Affirmation Pathway</td>
<td>48 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement Pathway</td>
<td>61 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parent Transfer Path</td>
<td>9 students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoning Expansion Path</td>
<td>74 students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Setiawati & Rahaju (2022) [9].

Before the percentage applied to the zoning system, schools found it difficult to determine how many students should be accepted, so that with the presence of the zoning system, opportunities have been in accordance with applicable regulations and needs in the field, although justice cannot absolutely occur because there are still obstacles in one of the pathways in the zoning system policy, namely the affirmation pathway between the number of quotas provided and the number of applicants who register is not balanced, requiring the selection of Setiawati & Rahaju (2022) [9].

As is well known, the zoning system aims to realize equitable education in Indonesia. However, in its implementation, this zoning system still raises pros and cons among the community. Some people feel benefited because they have a domicile that is close to a favorite school, but not a few people feel disadvantaged because they have to give up their dreams to enter their dream school due to the distance of domicile from the school. Some parents also prefer to send their children to private schools because they have a domicile that is close to a favorite school, but not a few people feel disadvantaged because they have a domicile that is close to a private school and another, including schools that are considered outstanding or not. Technically, the admission of new students is indeed delivered to each school are the same, there is no difference between one school and another, including schools that are considered outstanding or not. It is also felt that the zoning system still cannot ensure that every school will provide the same services. A reassessment of the zoning system is necessary to improve the policy in the future.

2.2 Implementation of Zoning System Policy

The implementation of this zoning system policy can be studied based on four policy implementation variables according to Edward III, namely communication, resources, organizational structure, attitudes or dispositions, which will be described as follows:

2.2.1 Communication

Communication and interaction are very important in establishing a coordination. Good interpersonal relationships will have a major influence on the policy implementation process (Savitri & Rahaju, 2016) [8]. Communication within the framework of conveying information to policy implementers regarding every standard and objective must be consistent and uniform from various information (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7]. Edward II in Widodo (2007) explains that there are several dimensions in the communication aspect, namely the dimensions of transmission, clarity, and consistency [13].

Communication of the implementation of this zoning system policy was carried out by the central government with the notification of the PPDB Zoning Regulation which was later updated to the Minister of Education and Culture Regulation Number 14 of 2018 and again updated to Permendikbud Number 01 of 2021 concerning Acceptance of New Learners in Kindergarten, Elementary School, Junior High School, Senior High School, and Vocational High School. The next communication was then followed up by the Regional Government to regulate the implementation of the zoning system by adjusting the circumstances of each region. For example, the Province of Yogyakarta issued the Governor of Yogyakarta Special Region Regulation Number 30 of 2020 concerning the Admission of New Learners for Senior High Schools, Vocational High Schools, and Special Schools. At the technical level, the authority was then given to the Education Office in each region, both at the provincial and city/district levels. Technical guidelines are also made to be followed up by schools at each level for the implementation of the zoning system.

Based on the results of research by Saharuddin & Khakim (2020), the education office, in this case the Yogyakarta Education Office, revealed that the facilities delivered to each school are the same, there is no difference between one school and another, including schools that are considered outstanding or not. Technically, the admission of new students is indeed returned to the school, so that the agency only makes the concept of the rules, then applied according to the needs and abilities of each school [7]. Looking at this description, it can be seen that the coordination and communication carried out in the implementation of the zoning system is top-down. Implementation carried out by policy implementers tends to be one-way. This is very likely to cause problems if the environment or target group cannot accept the policy.

Prior to implementation, socialization was conducted to the implementing apparatus and the community. The socialization process is carried out using various methods, such as online announcements, distribution of brochures and pamphlets in various schools, banners posted at the school gate, to the opening of information services for the community (call center) (Mai & Rahayu, 2021) [3]. In the zoning system implemented in
the PPDB of SMPN 3 Krian, communication is built through the School-Based Management Information System both between internal and external parties (Setiawati & Rahaju, 2022) [9]. Through this system, communication between the office and schools, schools and communities, and schools and villages can run well and synergize with each other to make the implementation of this zoning system a success.

Communication within the education office and schools is carried out through committee meetings, notifications related to regulation changes through web-based information systems, the use of social media such as Whatsapp groups and Youtube channels, and through letters delivered to schools. Meanwhile, communication established with external parties, in this case the community, communication is pursued through two channels, namely through social media such as websites and installation of banners containing complete information related to the PPDB zoning system. The office and schools through representatives of the PPDB committee also go directly to the field to see the actual conditions of prospective students when registering through the affirmation pathway.

Since it was first implemented in 2018, the technical regulations for the implementation of the zoning system have remained consistent and unchanged, only being updated several times to improve shortcomings in the implementation of the previous zoning system. Each committee involved has also clearly understood each task that will be undertaken through the PPDB socialization general meeting, PPDB implementation preparation coordination meeting, and PPDB implementation monitoring team. Information that has been conveyed to both the PPDB committee or parents of prospective students has been explained clearly and transparently through electronic media and face-to-face as well as with the issuance of technical regulations for the implementation of the PPDB zoning system, namely Permendikbud. Parents/guardians of students and students accept and understand well the information related to the zoning system regulations in PPDB.

2.2.2 Resource

According to Edward III in Banamtuan & Natonis (2020), no matter how clear and consistent a provision or rule is, if the policy implementers responsible for implementing the policy lack the resources to do the job effectively, the policy implementation will not be effective [2]. This is also very much in line with the opinion of Aziz in Taufik & Rahaju (2020) which states that success in the process of implementing a policy will depend on the ability to maximize existing resources [11]. In implementing a policy, the resources needed are human and non-human resources, such as information resources, authority resources, and facility resources. Based on the results of the analysis by Saharuddin & Khakim (2020), in the process of implementing the zoning system policy, the human resources needed in implementing the zoning system have been fulfilled through the PPDB committee in each school. The committee consists of representatives from the local Education Office and representatives from each school organizing PPDB [7]. In addition, improving the quality of teachers was also carried out, as was done at SMAN 1 Kupang where teachers were prepared to master the internet network through training and workshops to improve teacher competence in implementing the zoning system policy (Banamtuan & Natonis, 2020) [2]. Improving the quality of resource services is done to overcome the problems that exist due to the zoning system policy. Even so, not a few schools still lack the number of educators due to the teacher recruitment system that is centralized in the Education Office so that schools need a long time to meet the needs of teachers. As happened at SMPN 3 Krian where during the last two years many educators have retired or died, so that the available teaching staff is inadequate (Setiawati & Rahaju, 2022) [9].

In the non-human aspect, namely financial resources, the budget for implementing the zoning system is considered adequate. The budget comes from the School Operational Assistance (BOS) where the budget is used for the needs of the New Student Admission (PPDB), both in the form of operator needs, procurement of registration forms, making school banners, and other activities directly related to the New Student Admission activities. This has shown that the government has been responsible in implementing policies related to education management.

The availability of facilities and infrastructure is a non-human resource that is also very important in the implementation of a policy. The facilities and infrastructure available in implementing this policy are still uneven, where there are still some differences in the quality of facilities between schools. As in Sidoarjo, where physical facilities and other supporting facilities are considered adequate with sufficient classroom capacity and adequate information technology (Setiawati & Rahaju, 2022) [9]. However, in some peripheral areas of East Java, limited information technology is still a problem so that prospective students are forced to follow the PPDB process offline and the dissemination of information related to the zoning system is also less than optimal due to limited access to information technology.

2.2.3 Organizational Structure

In the implementation of public policies, the bureaucratic structure plays a role in avoiding fragmentation in policy implementation (Mai & Rahaju, 2021) [3]. Organizational structure variables are closely related to cooperation, coordination, work procedures, and Standard Operational Procedure (SOP) of policy implementers. The effectiveness of policy
implementation is highly dependent on the conditions of the bureaucratic organizational structure, so the conditions must be conducive (Suparno, 2017) [10].

In implementing the zoning system policy, the implementers involved consist of the Ministry of Education and Culture, regional leaders, provincial and district/city education offices, and education units. All implementing agents involved in implementing the zoning system policy are considered to be in accordance with the broad scope of the policy implementation area, where each implementer already has their respective duties and responsibilities in implementing this policy (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7].

Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) have been very clear and structured through the Permendikbud Regulation Number 01 of 2021, which is then reduced to regulations at the regional level such as Governor / Regent /, and Principal Decree. These regulations serve as guidelines for the PPDB committee in implementing the PPDB zoning system policy (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7]. The available SOPs have regulated the mechanisms, systems and procedures for implementing policies, the division of main tasks, functions, authorities, and responsibilities among policy actors (Banamtuan & Natonis, 2020) [2].

The PPDB zoning system implementation committee was formed in each school as an effort to increase access to better services for the community. As in SMPN 9 Samarinda, each individual is placed in each work unit in the organizational structure level according to the competence of each individual (Mai & Rahayu, 2021) [3]. Fragmentation or distribution of responsibilities has also been running well and evenly so that during the implementation of the PPDB zoning system, all PPDB committees involved have carried out their responsibilities properly and professionally. The appointment of the PPDB committee has also been based on the competencies possessed and the jobdesc of each PPDB committee is very clear in accordance with the decree issued by the Principal.

2.2.4 Attitude or Disposition

According to Edward III in Widodo (2007), disposition is the willingness, desire and tendency of policy actors to implement the policy seriously so that what is the policy objective can be realized. This disposition concerns the willingness and commitment of the organizers to implement the policy [13]. Edward III emphasized as quoted that the success of policy implementation is not only determined by the extent to which policy actors (implementers) know what to do and are able to do it, but also determined by the ability of the policy actors to have a strong disposition towards the policy being implemented (Widodo, 2007) [13]. The attitude of acceptance or rejection from this institution will greatly affect the success or failure of the performance of Public policy implementation (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7].

During the implementation of the PPDB zoning system policy, the attitude of the person in charge during PPDB was seen to be very totality, responsible, and carried out tasks according to details, and self-aware in accordance with applicable rules (Setiatiwati & Rahaju, 2022) [9]. According to Didik Wardaya, the Head of Planning and Quality Assurance of the DIY Disdikpora, acknowledged that this policy is good for realizing equitable distribution of quality education, without creating a gap with schools that are considered ordinary, lacking in achievement. This makes the dominance of favorite schools decrease, thus reducing the disparity in quality between favorite schools and ordinary schools. Actually, a good school has been built for a long time by the parents themselves, including the community in this case the family. Parents’ attention to children’s education will grow, so they will participate in improving schools that were mediocre to be better (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7].

Good support from the policy implementers has shown that the implemented policy is the result of the formulation of local residents who are very familiar with the problems they feel. However, this policy is indeed more top-down, so there are people who disagree and reject the system. This policy system is also made with coordination between implementing institutions, namely at the level of education institutions at the central level and regional level. This means that there is communication between organizations in the making and implementation of the zoning policy (Saharuddin & Khakim, 2020) [7].

Even so, there are still many policy implementers in schools who do not have a good attitude towards this policy. As a result of the zoning system policy, many schools are reluctant to innovate to compete with other schools, because schools already feel easy to get students without having to do marketing or innovation (Savitri & Rahaju, 2016) [8].

3. CLOSURE

3.1 Conclusion

Based on the results of the discussion that has been described using the policy implementation model from Edward III, conclusions can be drawn, that the implementation of the zoning system policy in PPDB is good enough as an effort to equalize education in Indonesia. The implementation of this policy has gone well, although there are still some pros and cons that occur in the community, but these pros and cons are getting less and less with the improvements that are always made by policy implementers.
Based on the results of the discussion that has been described using the policy implementation model from Edward III, conclusions can be drawn, that the implementation of the zoning system policy in PPDB is good enough as an effort to equalize education in Indonesia. The implementation of this policy has gone well, although there are still some pros and cons that occur in the community, but these pros and cons are getting less and less with the improvements that are always made by policy implementers.

In terms of resources consisting of human resources, funding resources, and infrastructure, it can be said that it has been well implemented. The human resources needed in implementing the zoning system have been fulfilled through the PPDB committee in each school. In the non-human aspect, namely financial resources, the budget for implementing the zoning system is considered adequate. However, facilities and infrastructure resources are still considered uneven because some schools located in remote or marginalized areas still do not have adequate facilities or are equivalent to schools in urban areas. This is also what still makes the zoning system policy considered detrimental because students who feel they have more competence, inevitably have to go to schools with inadequate facilities just because the school is the closest to their domicile.

The next aspect is the organizational structure, all implementing agents involved in implementing this zoning system policy are considered to be in accordance with the broad scope of the policy implementation area, where each implementer already has their respective duties and responsibilities in implementing this policy.

Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) have been very clear and structured through the regulation of Permendikbud Number 01 of 2021, which is then reduced to regulations at the regional level such as Governor / Regent /, and Principal Decree.

The last aspect is the attitude or disposition of the policy implementers who show an attitude of accepting the inclusive education policy. During the implementation of the PPDB zoning system policy, the attitude of the person in charge during PPDB was seen to be very totality, responsible, and carried out tasks according to details, and self-conscious in accordance with applicable regulations. However, there are still attitudes of policy implementers in some schools that do not support the achievement of the objectives of this policy implementation.

3.2 Suggestions

Based on the obstacles that occur in the process of implementing inclusive education, the researchers can provide some suggestions, as follows:

a. It is necessary to hold socialization and approach both formally and informally to parents of students to equalize perceptions, so that both parents and students do not feel disadvantaged by the zoning system policy.

b. Improving the quality and quantity of facilities and infrastructure in schools, especially in remote and marginalized areas. This is also in line with the purpose of the zoning system, which is to equalize education throughout Indonesia.

c. To improve the quality of teachers, it is recommended that training or workshops are conducted to motivate teachers to improve their quality for the sake of equitable quality of education throughout Indonesia.

d. The teacher recruitment system also needs to be made as efficient and effective as possible, so that schools that are short of teachers can immediately fulfill their needs.

e. In future research, it is strongly recommended to conduct research by going to the field to get more valid and credible data.

REFERENCES


